

REPUBLIQUE DU CAMEROON
Paix – Travail – Patrie
MINISTERE DE L'ENVIRONNEMENT
ET DES FORETS
CABINET DU MINISTRE
UNITE CENTRAL DE CONTROLE

REPUBLIC OF CAMEROON
Peace- Work – Fatherland
MINISTRY OF
ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTRY
CABINET MINISTER
CENTRAL CONTROL UNIT

**REPORT OF A JOINT MISSION TO MONITOR FORESTRY OPERATIONS
IN THE LITTORAL PROVINCE
SANAGA MARITIME DEPARTMENT
FROM 26th to 28th JUNE 2001**

Submitted by:
Mr ENGBWANG Emile
Mrs ONDOA née BEYEKANI
Mr. Njiang
Mr. Owada
Miss Vauthier
Mr. Wilson

1. CONTEXT

The youth association of Yawanda, Arevy, surprised at the absence of Recovery Authorisation No. 027 in the publication of valid titles of the Cameroon Tribune of 11th January 2000, and suspecting illegal logging on the part of the Panagiotis-Marelis company in the above mentioned area, informed the World Bank of this illegal activity. This latter referred the matter to the Minister of Environment and Forestry, who called for a joint CCU/Global Witness mission with a view to undertaking investigations into the logging being undertaken by Panagiotis-Marelis (PM) in the area in question.

By means of memorandum no. 2185/NS/MINEF/CAB/CCU dated 25/6/2001, a joint mission to monitor logging operations was initiated in the department of Sanaga-Maritime, Province of Littoral.

2. COMPOSITION OF THE MISSION

The Mission comprised:

CCU

Mr Engbwang	Head of CCU
Mrs Ondoa	Cabinet Minister

Global Witness

Mr Njiang	Global Witness
Mr Owada	Global Witness
Miss Vauthier	Global Witness
Mr Wilson	Global Witness

Field Staff

Edéa sub-prefect
Head of Sanaga-Maritime Wildlife Section

3. DATA RELATING TO RECOVERY AUTHORISATION NO. 27

Following call for bids no. 285/AAO/MINEF of 4th March 1999 (cf MINEF full discharge as/s of Recoveries Nos. 24 and 27 attached), the Panagiotis Marelis company was successfully awarded Recovery No. 027.

This Recovery is identified in the SIGIF with the data below:

Title:	Recovery 07-98-027
Validity:	3 rd December 1999-30 th June 2000
Area:	1,000 ha
Volume:	12,000 m3

In accordance with Decision No. 0944/D/MINEF/DF of 31st July 1999, the issuing of Recoveries and other titles was banned. Nonetheless, in order to ensure a realistic transition, for some companies had no titles at that time, full discharge was given to a number of companies to continue their activities within the Recoveries until 30th June 2000. Following numerous requests from companies whose wood was still deposited

in the forest on that date, special evacuation Authorisations were granted for the period from 24th August to 13th September 2000. After that date, all activity within the context of Recovery titles was illegal.

4. FIELD INVESTIGATIONS

4.1 Meeting with the Administrative and Technical Authorities

4.1.1 Meeting with the Sub-Prefect

The meeting with the Sub-Prefect was a customary courtesy. This meeting also enabled the team members to explain the aim of their trip to the Administrative Authorities, along with the team's expectations of their collaboration. This meeting enabled team members to obtain official documents relating to Recovery No. 027.

4.1.2 Meeting with the Departmental Delegation

The Departmental Delegate was absent, attending a seminar in Yaoundé. Because of this, the Team was unable to obtain cartographic documentation relating to the Recovery. NB. In the delegate's absence, it would be advisable that s/he entrust the care and access of documents relating to forestry monitoring to a deputy.

The Head of the Forestry Section provided the team with 3 series of DF10s relating to recovery no. 27. Being new to the post, he decided that the mission should be carried out with the assistance of the Head of the Wildlife Section, who has a better understanding of this file, given that he had deputised for the Head of Forestry Section during the period of Panagiotis-Marelis activity.

4.2 Meeting with the Traditional Authorities

The Team Leader first explained the aim of the mission and his desire to involve the local people in the work. The village chief spoke, recognising that the Panagiotis company had actually logged in the area within the context of a Recovery granted by the Ministry of Environment and Forestry.

The people acknowledged the existence of a disagreement with the logging company with regard to a road they wanted to see repaired (it is this problem which, brought to the knowledge of a local elite, was at the origin of the correspondence sent to the World Bank);

The people also acknowledged having received, at a rate of 1000 CFA/m³, the sum of 3,429,000 F CFA paid in three instalments:

1 st payment:	CFA 692,000
2 nd payment:	CFA 1,653,000
3 rd payment:	CFA 1,084,000
Total:	CFA 3,429,000

It should be noted that, according to corroborating information from local individuals, the President of the organisation's committee has, since the discharge of the last

instalment, reported the sum of 1,854,000 F CFA missing. This thus gives an actual total of 5,283,000 F CFA, paid by Panagiotis to the Yawanda local population.

The villagers' demand for 1,000 CFA per m³ was not provided for in the contractual conditions, and was thus in addition to the road repairs noted in the contractual conditions.

There seems to be agreement among the villagers with regard PM's period of activity around Yawanda. PM logged from January to June 2000, then suspended its operations because of the rains, and flooding in the region, then recommenced activity from January to March 2001. The team found no proof of activity subsequent to March 2001.

One villager, having contributed to the marking-out of the boundaries, showed the Team the corners and points of demarcation (see diagram). The villagers also noted that the line from point B to point C had not been marked out and that the company, having found a swamp inside the official boundary of point B, moved it inwards and, in compensation, extended its logging area beyond the allocated boundaries, between Nyong and point C, and beyond the initial point.

5. VERIFICATION OF LOGGING DOCUMENTS

In accordance with the documents provided to us by the Departmental Delegation for Environment and Forestry of Sanaga Maritime, the Panagiotis company logged in the area for a period of approximately three months. Compilations of DF10s give the following results:

ARB 027 DF-10 recorded in the departmental delegation

DF10	Date	Company	Code	Date of deposit	Total volume
008337	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	221,336
008338	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	222,425
008339	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	220,498
008340	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	254,989
008341	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	192,489
008342	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	209,470
008343	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	195,193
008344	3/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	10/4/2000	225,693
008326	1/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	248,864
008327	1/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	239,509
008328	1/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	205,843
008329	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	214,064
008330	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	266,392
008331	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	218,781
008332	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	242,022
008333	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	278,152
008334	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	319,125
008335	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	221,975
008336	2/00	Panagiotis Marelis	320	9/3/2000	236,881
					4,433,701

Nonetheless, SIGIF estimations put this production at 12,000 m3 of wood.

6. BOUNDARY VERIFICATION

The team encountered all kinds of difficulties in undertaking a verification of the boundaries, the forest being completely closed. Nonetheless, the points below were noted and recorded on a map, and they are located outside the boundaries of the Recovery:

N03E26.156'

E010E04.014' lumber yard

N03E23.953'

E010E03.008' point used as point A by the company

N03E21.187'

E010E02.442' tree stump nos. 506 and 508

CONCLUSION

The investigation terminated, its conclusions are that:

- Recovery no. 027, being carried out by Panagiotis Marelis is indeed a title granted by the Ministry of Environment and Forestry following Call for Bids No. 285/AAO/MINEF of 4th March 1999.
- Processing the points noted with GPS, it emerges that logging outside of the limits (see attached diagram) was undertaken by the company.

DIFFICULTIES ENCOUNTERED

The team was faced with a number of difficulties, namely:

- the very bad state of the road. The CCU's vehicle was seriously damaged and left at Edéa for repair.
- an evaluation of the logging was difficult because it took place over a year ago. The forest had partially reconstituted.

RECOMMENDATION

In order to gain an exact estimate of the area illegally logged, the team recommends that a CCU field evaluation mission should take place as soon as possible. The evaluation mission must, among other things, mark point B.

Central Control Unit
Signed

Independent Observer
Signed

WORLD BANK
International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
International Development Association

Resident Mission in Cameroon
BP 1128
Yaoundé, Cameroon

Our ref: 435/01-06/RR/LD/am

Yaoundé 1st June 2001

His Exc. Sylvestre Naah Ondoa
Minister for Environment and Forestry
Yaoundé

Re: Correspondence from the AREVY community and Mr. Ekemba Sooh regarding illegal logging in the area of the village of Yawanda, located in the buffer zone of the integral Douala-Edéa forest reserve.

Minister,

Please find attached a letter sent to the President of the World Bank regarding illegal logging in the area of the village of Yawanda. This letter is accompanied by two further letters addressed to yourself and to the World Bank Resident Representative regarding the same subject.

The situation described in these letters by the AREVY community is contrary to the efforts deployed by your ministerial department to guarantee the sustainability of the Cameroon forests and their contribution to socio-economic development. We would like to ask you what measures have been taken by your department to ascertain the truth of these accusations and to guarantee the strictest respect for forestry regulations. The letter from the AREVY community raises two questions in particular with regard to which we would also be very happy to receive responses from the Ministry.

Does the status of the “buffer zone” around the Douala-Edéa reserve automatically exclude logging operations from being undertaken in this area?
Does the Panagyotis Marelis company hold a title to log within the area of Yawanda that appears on the official list of valid titles?

Should verification missions be required to undertake further visits, we would like to suggest that these missions be accompanied by the independent observer recently mandated by yourselves.

I look forward to receiving your response with regard to these concerns.

Yours most sincerely,

Robert Lacey
Resident Representative

CC: Ekemba Sooh
Mbieme Lénard, Ekoue Emile, AREVY Community

REPUBLIQUE DU CAMEROON
Paix – Travail – Patrie
MINISTERE DE L'ENVIRONNEMENT
ET DES FORETS
CABINET DU MINISTRE
UNITE CENTRAL DE CONTROLE

REPUBLIC OF CAMEROON
Peace- Work – Fatherland
MINISTRY OF
ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS
CABINET MINISTER
CENTRAL CONTROL UNIT

Yaoundé 25th June 2001

**MEMORANDUM NO. 2185/NS/MINEF/UCC
REGARDING ESTABLISHMENT OF A MISSION TO MONITOR LOGGING
OPERATIONS IN THE SANAGA MARITIME DEPARTMENT, LITTORAL
PROVINCE**

Signing of this memorandum will lead to the immediate establishment of a mission to monitor logging activities in the Department of Sanaga Maritime, Littoral Province.

This mission will comprise:

- ENGBWANG Emile, Team Leader
- Mrs ONDOA née BEYEKENI, Team Member
- Global Witness

And will have the tasks of:

1. Checking for fraudulent logging activity, particularly that perpetrated around the village of Yawanda by Panagiotis Marelis in the said area;
2. Noting and taking criminal proceedings against cases of fraudulent operations;
3. Monitoring the forest area en route.

The team may have recourse to the forces of public order where necessary.

The Departmental Delegate of Sanaga Maritime should join this mission.

A detailed report must be sent to the Minister for the Environment and Forestry within 7 days of completion of this mission.

The Minister for the Environment and Forestry
Signed and stamped
Sylvestre NAAH ONDOA

MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTRY
FORESTRY DEPARTMENT

REPUBLIC OF CAMEROON
Peace- Work - Fatherland

Yaoundé 3rd December 1999

No. 3523/L/MINEF/DF/SDAFF/SAG

THE MINISTER FOR THE ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTRY

Re: Full discharge a/s of recovery nos 24 and 27.

To: The Director of the MARELIS PANAGIOTIS company BP 1858 DOUALA

I am pleased to inform you that a full discharge has been granted in your favour with a view to undertaking logging activities within the context of recovery nos. 24 and 27, which were awarded to you in the department of SANAGA-MARITIME, *arrondissement* of EDEA, following call for tenders No. 285/AAO/MINEF of 4th March 1999.

This full discharge is valid until 30th June 2000 and is issued with all advantages thereto pertaining.

Copies:

Signed and Stamped
Sylvestre NAAH ONDOA

-DPEF/Littoral/Douala

-DDEF/Sanaga-Maritime/Edéa

Douala date illegible

No. 1336/NARB/MINEF/DPEF/LT/SPF/BEIF

**NOTIFICATION OF WOOD RECOVERY AUTHORISATION NO.
27/AP/MINEF/DPEFL**

The undersigned Provincial Delegation for the Environment and Forestry of the Littoral Province at Douala,

- Given the results of the Technical Commission for allocation of wood recoveries in the Littoral Province forming the object of Notice of Call for Tender No. 285/AAO/MINEF of 4th March 1999;
- Given the agreement of the Minister for the Environment and Forestry to allocate the forest forming the object of Public Notice No. 27/AP/MINEF/DPEFL to the company MARELIS PANAGIOTIS BP 1858, Douala;
- Given the approval of the contractual conditions for this recovery by His Exc. The Minister for the Environment and Forestry granting full discharge to the MARELIS PANAGIOTIS company;
- Given letter no. 3623/L/MINEF/DF/SDAFF/SAG of 3rd December 1999 from the Minister for Environment and Forestry granting a full discharge to the MARELIS PANAGIOTIS company;
- Given the full payment of the amount proposed by the beneficiary;
- Given the request of the interested party;

Does hereby notify the MARELIS PANAGIOTIS company of the above referenced wood recovery authorisation located in the Department of Sanaga-Maritime, Arrondissement of Edéa, logging zone 1.

Article 1: The work of this recovery must not cause any hindrance to the exercise of the local population's rights of use.

Article 2: The MARELIS PANAGIOTIS company is required to repair the roads in the recovery area in accordance with the clauses of the contractual conditions.

Article 3: The waybill records for transportation of wood will be counter-signed by the Departmental Delegate for the Environment and Forestry of Sanaga-Maritime.

Article 4: The timber dues will be determined by the relevant departments of the Tax Authority on the basis of monthly production declarations issued by the Provincial Delegation for the Environment and Forestry in Littoral Province. The project record file (DF10) must be submitted to the Provincial Delegation for the Environment and Forestry of Littoral Province at the latest ten (10) days following the month of activity with receipt of deposit, on pain of sanction.

Article 5: Monitoring of these recovery activities will be undertaken by the appropriate departments of the Provincial Delegation of the Environment and Forestry of the Littoral Province jointly with the Departmental Delegation for the Environment and Forestry of Sanaga-Maritime.

Article 6: The length of validity of this recovery is twelve (12) months as from its date of notification.

Article 7: Any irregularities noted in the way this recovery is carried out will be suppressed, according to the current forestry regulations.

Article 8: The Departmental Delegation of the Environment and the Forestry of Sanaga-Maritime will write a detailed report to the Provincial Delegation at the end of the work.

Signed and stamped
Provincial Delegate for the Environment and Forestry
Joseph Claude ABENA
Engineer in Wood Science and Technology
Engineer in Forestry Techniques

Copies:
MINEF/DF/YDE
DDEF/SM/Edéa
The interested party
File
Archives

MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTRY
PROVINCIAL DELEGATION FOR THE
ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS OF LITTORAL
PROVINCE

REPUBLIC OF CAMEROON
Peace- Work - Fatherland

Douala,

**CONTRACTUAL CONDITIONS COVERING AUTHORISATION FOR
RECOVERY OF WOOD**

No 27/AP/MINEF/DPL/SPF OF 4th March 1999
GRANTED TO Mr. PANAGIOTIS MARELIS
FOLLOWING CALL FOR TENDERS No. 285/AAO/MINEF
of 4th March 1999

ADMINISTRATIVE LOCATION OF THE AREA:

- a) PROVINCE: LITTORAL
- b) DEPARTMENT: SANAGA-MARITIME
- c) ARRONDISSEMENT: EDEA
- d) RURAL COMMUNE: EDEA

INTRODUCTORY NOTE

These contractual conditions governing the wood recovery authorised to Mr. PANAGIOTIS MARELIS BP 858, Douala by means of letter No. of , comprise general clauses and specific clauses.

The general clauses relate to technical provisions in the area of logging operations. The specific clauses impose obligations on the operator in the area of finance, wood processing and the implementation of community works.

A- GENERAL CLAUSES:

Article 1: The wood recovery granted to Mr PANAGIOTIS MARELIS covers an area of 1000 ha of forest located in the province of Littoral, department of Sanaga-Maritime, *arrondissement* of Edéa.

Article 2: The area of forest in question is thus bordered as follows:

The point of base A is found on the Nyong at 1.8 km to the north of the confluence of the rivers Nyong and Nkoudou.

To the north of point A, following a straight line AB = 6.0 kms on a bearing of 247 degrees, can be found point B.

To the west of point B, following a straight line BC = 4.0 kms on a bearing of 120 degrees, can be found point C.

To the south and the east of point C, following a straight line CA = 5.0 km on a bearing of 29 degrees, one returns to point A.

Article 3: The zone subject to recovery must be demarcated prior to the start of work.

Article 4: The logging of tree species must in no way hinder the exercise of the local populations' use rights.

Article 5: In accordance with current regulations, the interested party must respect logging procedures (log marking, use of documents governing logging...).

Article 6: Respect for maturity diameter is compulsory except in areas where major roads are being created and dug.

B- SPECIFIC CLAUSES

Article 7: This recovery is subject to payment of the costs stated below:

Timber royalty (RF) in FCFA: 5,100,000 (five million one hundred thousand)

13% in addition to the RF: 663,000 (six hundred and sixty-three thousand)

Article 8: Payment of the above costs will be made in the following manner:

- 50% to the State, that is: 2,550,000 (two million, five hundred and fifty thousand)
- 40% to the commune in question, that is: 2,040,000 (two million and forty thousand)
- 10% to the local community, that is: 510,000 (five hundred and ten thousand)
- 13% to the Forest Officers, that is, 663,000 (six hundred and sixty three thousand)

In accordance with the Finance Law for the current budgetary year.

Article 9: The operator is required to pay timber dues for volumes of timber logged, issued to him by the Provincial Delegate for the Environment and Forestry of the Littoral Province.

II- PARTICIPATION IN THE PROVISION OF SOCIO-ECONOMIC INFRASTRUCTURE

Article 10: In accordance with the development project that underlies this recovery and the minutes of the meeting between the community of the Yassoukou canton and the logging company, the interested party is required to undertake the following work:

I – WORKS TO BE UNDERTAKEN

Mr PANAGIOTIS MARELIS is required to restore the roads in the area of recovery.

C – OTHER PROVISIONS

SECTION I – Operator's rights.

Article 11: The interested party will enjoy all rights linked to logging and the marketing of timber thus gathered, in accordance with current forestry regulations.

SECTION II Control and Monitoring of Activities

Article 12: The Provincial Delegate for the Environment and Forestry of the Littoral Province will have responsibility for supervising the recovery activities covered by these contractual conditions.

This will include:

- Approving the timber cruise
- Notifying the start of works in the area of recovery
- Issuing the project records, waybills and statements of sums due
- The local forestry departments and/or the Provincial Delegate for the Environment and Forestry of the Littoral Province will be responsible for controlling activities undertaken within the context of this title on the ground.

SECTION III Penalties

Article 13: These can be found in the provisions of law 94/01 of 20th January 1994 and its implementing order.

READ AND APPROVED

Signed
The Operator

FOR APPROVAL

Signed and stamped
The Minister for the Environment
and Forestry

MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTRY
PROVINCIAL DELEGATION OF THE LITTORAL
PROVINCIAL FORESTRY DEPARTMENT

REPUBLIC OF CAMEROON
Peace- Work - Fatherland

Douala 25th May 1999

No. 215/FV/MINEF/DPL/SPF/BEIF

PAYMENT SHEET

The municipal tax collector of the commune of EDEA
Will receive from Mr PANAGIOTIS MARELIS BP 1858 Douala
The sum of FCFA 2,550,000 (two million five hundred and fifty thousand)
By way of part payment of the financial package (40% and 10%) proposed by this
logging operator for the open woodland under recovery according to public
notification No. 27/AP/MINEF/DPEFL of 4th March 1999 and for which he will be
issued with a receipt. This sum will be distributed as follows:

- 2,040,000 for the Commune of EDEA
- 510,000 for the populations of the Yassoukou canton.

Signed and stamped
Provincial Forestry Department of the Littoral
Illegible EDIMA Salomon
Water and Forestry Engineer

Checked and cashed
Receipt No. 626972
of 28/5/99 for FCFA
2,040,000
Municipal Tax Collector

Original receipt seen and verified
No. 626973 of 28/5/99
In francs above = 510,000
On

Copies:
Receipts Assistant
Forestry Department
Interested Party

DATE	CODE	STAMP AND SIGNATURE	METHOD OF PAYMENT	DESCRIPTION OF RECEIPT	CHARGE	DETAILS	AMOUNT RECEIPT NO	DEBTOR
28-5-99								
LOCAL COUNCILS NO. 626972	12345		CHEQUE NO 172334 26/5/99	TENDER 40% AND 10% NO 27/MPI/MINEF/DPEFI of 4 th March 1999	480N98321	2,040,000	2,040,000	PANAGIOTIS MARELIS TWO MILLION FORTY THOUSAND

DATE	CODE	STAMP AND SIGNATURE	METHOD OF PAYMENT	DESCRIPTION OF RECEIPT	CHARGE	DETAILS	AMOUNT RECEIPT NO	DEBTOR
28-5-99								
LOCAL COUNCILS NO. 626973	12345		CHEQUE NO 172335 26/5/99	TENDER 40% AND 10% NO. 27/MPI/MINEF/DPEFI of 4 th March 1999	480N98321	510,000	510,000	PANAGIOTIS MARELIS FIVE HUNDRED AND TEN THOUSAND